8. "Don't you recognize me, Yeshodhara? I am Devadatta who loves you."

9. " Devadatta, I knew you to be false and vile. I thought you would make a bad monk, but did not suspect you to be so mean-minded."

10. " Yeshodhara, Yeshodhara, I love you" pleaded Devadatta. "And your husband shows you nothing but contempt. He has been cruel to you. Love me and revenge his cruelty."

11. Yeshodhara's pale and emaciated face became tinged with a purple hue. Tears rolled down her cheeks.

12. "Devadatta, it is you who are cruel to me. Even if your love were sincere, it would have been an insult to me. You are simply lying when you say you love me.

13. "When I was young and pretty you hardly looked at me. Now I am old, broken down by sorrow and anguish, you have come at night to declare your treacherous and guilty love. You are a base coward."

14. And she shouted: " Devadatta, get out from the place," and Devadatta left the place.

15. Devadatta was very angry with the Buddha who did not make him the chief in the Sangh and instead made Sariputta and Mogallana the chief men in the Sangh. Devadatta made three attempts on the Buddha's life, but did not succeed in any of them.

16. At one time the Blessed One was walking up and down in the shade below the hill called the Vultures Peak (Girdhra Kuta).

17. Devadatta climbed it up and hurled down a large stone with the intention of depriving the Blessed One of his life, but it fell upon another rock and there it was entombed; only a splinter falling from it made the foot of the Blessed One to bleed.

18. A second time he made an attempt to take the life of the Buddha.

19. This time Devadatta went to Prince Ajatasatru and said: "Give me some men." And Ajatasatru, the prince gave orders to his men : " Whatsoever the worthy Devadatta tells you, do that."

VI

20. Then to one man Devadatta gave command: "Go, my friend ; the Samana Gautama is staying at such a place. Kill him." And the man returned and said to him : " I cannot deprive the Blessed One of his life.

21. He made a third attempt on the life of the Buddha.

22. This time there was at Rajgraha an elephant named Nalagiri, fierce and a man-slayer.

23. And Devadatta went into Rajgraha and to the elephant stables, and said to the elephant keepers : "I, my friends, am a relative of the raja, and am able to advance a man occupying a low position to a high position, and to order an increase of his rations or of his pay."

24. Therefore, my friends when Samana Gautama shall have arrived at this carriage road, then loose the elephant Nalagiri and let him go down the road.

25. Devadatta engaged archers to kill the Buddha. He had also let loose on his way the mad elephant Nalagiri.

26. But he did not succeed. When these attempts became known, Devadatta lost all the public endowments given to him. And even the king (Ajatasatru) stopped giving him interview.

27. For living he had to beg from house to house. Devadatta received many favours from Ajatasatru, which he could not retain long. Devadatta lost all his influence after the Nalagiri incident.

28. By his acts, Devadatta becoming very unpopular in Magadha left it for Kosala, thinking that Prasenjit might receive him cordially. But he was contemptuously driven out by Prasenjit.

§ 7. *Brahmins and the Buddha*

(i)

1. Once when the Blessed One was travelling about in the Kosala country with a large company of the monks, he went down to a Brahmin village named Thuna.

2. The Brahmin householders of Thuna heard the news, " The Samana Gautama, they say, has arrived in the field of our village."

3. Now the Brahmin householders were non-believers, holding wrong views and avaricious by nature.

4. They said, "If the Samana Gautama should enter this village and stay two or three days, he would convert all these people. Then the Brahmin religion would have no support. We must, therefore, prevent his entry in our village.

5. To reach the village a river had to be crossed and the Brahmins, in order to prevent the Blessed One from entering the village, took the boats away from the landing places, and made the bridges and causeways unusable.

6. They filled all the wells except one with weeds and the like and concealed the watering-places, rest-houses and sheds.

7. The Blessed One learned of their misdeeds and having compassion on them, crossed the river with his company of monks, went on, and in due course of time reached the Brahmin village of Thuna.

8. He left the road and sat down at the foot of a tree. At that moment many women were passing by near the Blessed One carrying water.

9. And in that village an agreement had been made, " If the Samana Gautama comes there, there is to be no welcome or the like made for him and when he comes to a house, neither to him nor to his disciples is any food or water to be given."

10. Then a certain Brahmin's slave girl, going along with a jar of water, saw the Blessed One and the monks, realized that they were weary and thirsty, and being of devout heart, wanted to give them water,

11. "Even and though the people of this village have resolved that nothing at all is to be given to the Samana Gautama and not even a show of respect is to be made," she said to herself, " yet if after I have found these supreme fields of merit and worthy

VI

recipients of meritorious giving, I do not lay the foundation for my salvation by a mere giving of water, when hereafter shall I be released from woe ?"

12. " So be it, my masters ! Let every one who lives in the village beat or bind me, still I will give a gift of water to a field of merit such as this."

13. When she had made this resolve, though the other women carrying water tried to stop her, without regard for her life, she lifted down the water jar from her head, placed it on one side, approached the Blessed One, and gave him water; he washed his hands and feet and drank the water.

14. Her master, the Brahmin, heard of her giving water to the Blessed One. " She has broken the rule of the village and I am blamed," he said, and burning with rage and grinding his teeth he hurled her to the ground and beat her with hands and feet. Because of that she died.

(ii)

1. Now Brahmin Dona visited the Exalted One and greeted him; and after exchanging the customary words of greetings, sat down at one side. So seated, Brahmin Dona said to the Exalted One :

2. "I have heard it said, Master Gotama, that Master Gotama does not salute aged, venerable Brahmins, well stricken in years, long on life's road, grown old—nor rise up for them, nor offer them a seat.

3. " Master Gotama, it is just so; Master Gotama does none of these things ... to aged, venerable Brahmins . . . This is not right, Master Gotama."

4. " Do you not profess to be a brahmin, Dona ?"

5. " If of anyone, Master Gotama, in speaking rightly it should be said: ' The brahmin is well born on both sides, pure in descent as far back as seven generations, both of mother and father, unchallenged and without reproach in point of birth; studious, carrying the mantras in mind, a past master in the three Vedas with the indices and ritual, in phonology too, and in the legends; an expert in verse and grammar, skilled in reading the marks of a great man, in

speculation on the universe' to be sure of me, Master Gotama, in speaking rightly that thing should be said; for I, Master Gotama, am so born . . . so skilled ..."

6. "Dona, those Brahmin-sages of old, mantra-makers, mantra-sayers, whose ancient collection of mantra verses, hymns and sayings, Brahmins know every hymn, every say, every word the word, ever have the sayings said to wit: Atthaka, Vamaka, Vamadeva. Vassamitta, Yamadaggi, Angirasa, Bharadvaja, have declared: the Brahma-like, the deva-like, the bounded, the breaker of bounds, and fifthly, the Brahmin outcast, which of them, Dona, are you?"

7. "We know not of these five Brahmins, Master Gotama ; yet we know that we are Brahmins. It were well for me if Master Gotama would teach me Dhamma so that I may know of them five."

8. "Then listen, Brahma, give heed and I will speak!"

9. "Yes sir," replied he; and the Exalted One said:

10. "And how, Dona, becomes a Brahmin Brahma-like ?"

11. "Take the case, Dona, of a Brahmin who is well born on both sides, pure in descent as far back as seven generations, both of mother and father, unchallenged and without reproach in point of birth—he for eight and forty years leads to the Brahma-life of virginity, applying himself to the teacher's fee for teaching according to Dhamma, not non-Dhamma.

12. "And what there is Dhamma, Dona? Never as ploughman nor trader nor cowherd nor bowman nor rajah's man nor by any craft (to get his living), but solely by going about for alms, despising not the beggar's bowl.

13. "And he hands over the teacher's fee for teaching, has his hair-beard shaved off, dons the yellow robe and goes forth from the home to the homeless life.

14. "And thus gone forth, he abides in mind pervading with amity one world quarter, so a second,

VI

a third, a fourth; then above, below, athwart, everywhere, the whole wide world he pervades with thoughts of amity, far-reaching, expansive, measureless, without hatred or ill-will

15. "He abides in mind pervading with pity . . . sympathy . . . poise, one world quarter, so a second, a third, a fourth; then above, below, athwart, everywhere, the whole wide world he pervades with thoughts of pity, sympathy and poise, far-reaching, expansive, measureless, without hatred or ill-will.

16. " And having made these four Brahma-abidings become, on the breaking up of the body after death, he arises in the well-faring Brahma world. Thus, Dona, Brahmin becomes Brahma-like.

17. " And how, Dona, becomes a Brahmin deva-like ?

18. " Take the case, Dona, of a Brahmin of similar birth and conduct .... He does not get a living by ploughing and so forth, but by going about for alms.... He hands over the teacher's fee for teaching and seeks a wife according to Dhamma, not non-Dhamma.

19. " And what then is Dhamma? Not with one bought or sold, but only with a Brahmani on whom water has been poured. And he goes only to a Brahmani, not to the daughter of an outcast, hunter, bamboo-worker, cart-maker, or aboriginal, nor goes to a woman with child, nor to one giving suck, nor to one not in her season.

20. " And wherefore, Dona, goes not a Brahmin to one with child ? If he go, the boy or girl will surely be foully born, therefore he goes not. And wherefore goes he not to one giving suck ? If he go, the boy or girl will surely be an unclean suckling, therefore he goes not.

21. "And wherefore goes he not to one not in her season? If, Dona, a Brahmin go to one not in her season, never for him does the Brahmani become a means for lust, for sport, for pleasure; the Brahmani is for the Brahmin just as a means to beget offspring.

22. " And when in wedlock he has begotten (a child), he has his hair-beard shaved off. . . and goes forth ....

23. " And being thus gone forth, aloof from sensuous appetites ... he enters and abides in the first (to the) fourth musing ... he enters and abides in the first (to the) fourth musing.

24. "And having made these four musings become, on the breaking up of the body after death, he arises in the well-faring heaven world.

25. "Thus, Dona, a Brahmin becomes deva-like.

26. " And how, Dona, becomes a Brahmin Brahmin bounded ?

27. "Take the case, Dona of a Brahmin of similar birth and conduct . . . who weds in like manner. . . .

28. "And when in wedlock he has begotten a child, the fondness for children obsesses him and he settles on the family estate, and does not go forth from the home to the homeless life.

29. " In the bounds of the Brahmin of old he stays nor transgresses them; and it is said: ' Within bounds he keeps and transgresses not.' And therefore the Brahmin is called bounded.

30. " Thus, Dona, the Brahmin becomes bounded.

31. "And how, Dona, becomes a Brahmin- a breaker of bounds ?

32. "Take the case, Dona, of a Brahmin of similar birth and conduct. ... He hands over the teacher's fee and seeks a wife either according to Dhamma or non-Dhamma: one bought or sold or Brahmani on whom the water-pouring ceremony has been performed.

33. "He goes to a Brahmani or to the daughter of a noble or a low-caste man or a serf ; to the daughter of an outcast or a hunter or a bamboo-worker or a cart-maker or an aboriginal; he goes to a woman with child, to one giving suck, to one in her season, to one not in her season; and for him the Brahmani

becomes just a means for lust, for sport and for pleasure or to beget offspring.

34. "And he keeps not within the ancient Brahmin bounds, but transgresses them; and it is said: 'He keeps not within bounds but transgresses,' and therefore he is called a breaker of bounds.

35. "Thus, Dona, the Brahmin becomes a breaker of bounds.

36. "And how, Dona, becomes a Brahmin a Brahmin outcast?

37. "Take the case, Dona, of a Brahmin of similar birth, he for eight and forty years leads the Brahma-life of virginity, applying himself to the mantras; then, completing that course, he seeks the teaching fee for teaching; (he gets his living according to Dhamma or non-Dhamma) as ploughman, trader, cowherd, bowman, rajah's man or by some craft or, despising not the beggar's bowl, just by going about for alms.

38. "On handing back the teacher's fee, he seeks a wife according to Dhamma or non-Dhamma; one bought or sold, or a Brahmani on whom water has been poured. He goes to a Brahmani or any other woman . . . one with child, giving suck and so forth... and she is for him a means for lust ... or to beget offspring. He leads a life doing all these things.

39. "Then the Brahmans say thus of him: 'How is it that an honourable Brahmin leads this sort of life?'

40. "And to this he replies: 'Just as fire burns clean things or unclean, but not by that is the fire defiled ; even so, good sirs, if a Brahmin lead a life doing all these things, not by that is a Brahmin defiled.'

41. And it is said: 'He leads a life doing all these things,' and therefore he is called a Brahmin outcast.

42. 'Thus, Dona, a Brahmin becomes a Brahmin outcast.

43. "Verily, Dona, those Brahmin sages of old,

mantra-makers, mantra-sayers, whose ancient collection hymn, say, word each rest ... these five Brahmins declared; the Brahma-like, the deva-like, the bounded, the breaker of bounds and, fifthly, the Brahmin outcast.

44. "Which of them Dona, are you ?"

45. "If such there are, Master Gotama, we at least do not fulfil (the ways) of the Brahmin-outcast ?

46. "But it is marvellous what you say, Master Gotama ... let Master Gotama take me as a lay-disciple, gone to his refuge, henceforth as long as life lasts."

PART III

Critics of His Doctrines

1. Critics of Open Admission to the Sangh.
2. Critics of The Rule or Vows.
3 Critics of the Doctrine of Ahimsa.
4. Charge of Preaching Virtue and Creating Gloom.
5. Critics of the Theory of Soul and Rebirth.
6. Charge of being an Annihilationist.

§ 1. Critics of Open Admission to the Sangh

1. It was open for the Sangh to admit a layman who was merely a disciple.

2. There were persons who criticised the Lord for making the Sangh a wide open temple for anybody to enter.

3. They argued that under such a scheme it may well happen that after they have been admitted into the Order they give it up, and return again to the lower state and by their back-sliding the people are led to say : " Vain must be this religion of Samana Gotama, which these men have given up."

4. The criticism was not well founded and had altogether missed the intention of the Blessed Lord in making such a scheme.

5. The Blessed Lord replied that in establishing his religion he had constructed a bathing tank full of the excellent waters of emancipation—the bath of good law.

6. It was the Lord's desire that whosoever is polluted with stains of sin, he, bathing in it, can wash away all his sins.

7. And if anyone, having gone to the bathing tank of good law, should not bathe in it, but turn back polluted as before and return again to the lower state, it is he who is to be blamed and not the religion.

8. "Or could I," said the Blessed Lord, "after constructing this bathing tank for enabling people to wash away their sins, say : ' Let no one who is dirty go down into this tank ! Let only those whose dust and dirt have been washed away, who are purified and stainless go down into the tank.'

9. " On such terms what good would have been my religion ? "

10. The critics forgot that the Blessed Lord did not wish to confine the benefit only to a few. He wanted to keep it open to all, to be tried by all.

§ 2. *Critics of the Rule of Vows*

1. Why are the five precepts not enough ? Why vows are felt necessary? These were the questions that were often raised.

2. If was argued that if diseases would abate without medicine, what could be the advantage of weakening the body by emetics, by purges, and other like remedies?

3. Just so, if laymen, living at home and enjoying the pleasures of the senses, can realize in themselves the conditions of peace, the Supreme Good, Nibbana, by taking precepts, what is the need of the bhikkhu taking upon himself these vows ?

4. The Blessed Lord devised the vows because of the virtues inherent in them.

5. A life conditioned by vows is certain to bring with it growth in goodness, it is itself a protection against a fall.

6. Those who take vows and keep them as self-dependents, are emancipated.

7. The keeping of vows is the restriction of lust, and of malice, of pride, the cutting of evil thoughts.

8. Those who take vows and keep them, well guarded are they indeed and altogether pure are they in manners and in mind.

9. Not so with mere taking of precepts.

10. In the case of the precepts there is no protection against moral decline as there is in the case of vows.

11. A life of vows is very difficult and a life of precepts not so. It is necessary for mankind to have some who live the life of vows. So the Blessed Lord prescribed both.

§ *3. Critics of the Doctrine of Ahimsa*

1. There were persons who objected to the doctrine of Ahimsa. They said that it involved surrender or non-resistance to evil.

2. This is a complete misrepresentation of what the Blessed Lord taught by his doctrine of Ahimsa.

3. The Blessed Lord has made his position clear on various occasions so as to leave no room for ambiguity or misunderstanding.

4. The first such occasion to which reference should be made is the occasion when he made a rule regarding the entry of a soldier in the Sangh.

5. At one time the border provinces of the kingdom of Magadha were agitated. Then the Magadha king Seniya Bimbisara gave order to the Commander of the army: ' Well now, go and ask your officers to search through the border provinces for the offenders, punish them and restore peace." The Commander acted accordingly.

6. On hearing the orders of the Commander the officers found themselves placed in a dilemma. They knew that the Tathagatha taught that those who go to war and find delight in fighting, do evil and produce great demerit. On the other hand, here was the king's order to capture the offenders and to kill them. Now what shall we do, asked the officers to themselves.

7. Then these officers thought: "If we could enter the order of the Buddha we would be able to escape from the dilemma."

8. Thus these officers went to the bhikkhus and asked them for ordination; the bhikkhus conferred on them the pabbajja and upasampada ordinations and the officers disappeared from the army.

9. The Commander of the army finding that the officers were not to be seen, asked the soldiers: "Why, how is it that the officers are nowhere to be seen ?" "The officers, lord, have embraced religious life of the bhikkhus," replied the soldiers.

10. Then the Commander of the army was annoyed, and became very angry: "How can the bhikkhus ordain persons in the royal army ?"

11. The Commander of the army informed the king of what had happened. And the king asked the

officers of justice: "Tell me, my good sirs, what punishment does he deserve who ordains a person in the royal service ?"

12. "The Upagghaya, Your Majesty, should be beheaded; to him who recites (the Kammavaka), the tongue should be torn out; to those who form the chapter, half of their ribs should be broken

13. Then the king went to the place where the Blessed One was; and after obeisance informed him of what had happened.

14. " The Lord well knows that there are kings who are against the Dhamma. These hostile kings are ever ready to harass the bhikkhus even for trifling reasons. It is impossible to imagine the lengths to which they might go in their ill-treatment of the bhikkhus if they find that the bhikkhus are seducing the soldiers to leave the army and join the Sangh. Pray Lord to do the needful to avert the disaster."

15. The Lord replied: " It was never my intention to allow soldiers under the cloak of Ahimsa or in the name of Ahimsa to abandon their duty to the king or to their country."

16. Accordingly the Blessed One made a rule against the admission of persons in royal service to the Sangh and proclaimed it to the bhikkhus, saying: "Let no one, O Bhikkhus, who is in the royal service, receive the Pabbajja ordination. He who confers the Pabbajja ordination on such a person will be guilty of a dukkata offence."

17. A second time the Blessed One was cross-examined on the subject of Ahimsa by Sinha, a General in the army, and who was a follower of Mahavir.

18. Sinha asked: " One doubt still lurks in my mind concerning the doctrine of the Blessed One. Will the Blessed One consent to clear the cloud away so that I may understand the Dhamma as the Blessed One teaches it."

19. The Tathagata having given his consent., Sinha said: " I am a soldier, O Blessed One, and am appointed by the king to enforce his laws

and to wage his wars. Does the Tathagata, who teaches kindness without end and compassion with all sufferers, permit the punishment of the criminal ? And further, does the Tathagata declare that it is wrong to go to war for the protection of our homes, our wives, our children, and our property ? Does the Tathagata teach the doctrine of a complete self-surrender, so that I should suffer the evil-doer to do what he pleases and yield submissively to him who threatens to take by violence what is my own ? Does the Tathagata maintain that all strifes, including such warfare as is waged for a righteous cause, should be forbidden?"

20. The Lord replied : "The Tathagata says: 'He who deserves punishment must be punished, and he who is worthy of favour must be favoured. Yet at the same time he teaches to do no injury to any living being but to be full of love and kindness. These injunctions are not contradictory, for whosoever must be punished for the crimes which he has committed suffers his injury not through the ill-will of the judge but on account of his evil-doing. His own acts have brought upon him the injury that the executor of the law inflicts. When a magistrate punishes, let him not harbour hatred in his breast, yet a murderer, when put to death, should consider that this is the fruit of his own act. As soon as he will understand that the punishment will purify his soul, he will no longer lament his fate but rejoice at it.' "

21. A proper understanding of these instances would show that the Ahimsa taught by the Blessed Lord was fundamental. But it was not absolute.

22. He taught that evil should be cured by the return of good. But he never preached that evil should be allowed to overpower good.

23. He stood for Ahimsa. He denounced Himsa. But he did not deny that Himsa may be the last resort to save good being destroyed by evil.

24. Thus it is not that the Blessed Lord taught a dangerous doctrine. It is the critics who failed to understand its significance and its scope.

§ 4. *Charge of Preaching Virtue and Creating Gloom*

(1)

Dukkha as the Cause of Gloom

1. Dukkha in its original sense given to it by Kapila means unrest, commotion.

2. Initially it had a metaphysical meaning.

3. Later on it acquired the meaning of suffering and sorrow

4. The two senses were not far detached. They were very close.

5. Unrest brings sorrow and suffering.

6. Soon it acquired the meaning of sorrow and suffering from social and economic causes.

7. In what sense did the Buddha use the word sorrow and suffering ?

8. There is a sermon on record from which it is clear that the Buddha was very much aware that poverty was a cause of sorrow.

9. In that sermon he says—" Monks, is poverty a woeful thing for a worldly wanton ? "

10. " Surely, Lord."

11. " And when a man is poor, needy, in straits, he gets into debt, and is that woeful too ?"

12. " Surely, Lord."

13. " And when he gets into debt, he borrows, and is that woeful too ? "

14. "Surely, Lord."

15. "And when the bill falls due, he pays not and they press him; is that woeful too?"

16. "Surely, Lord."

17. " And when pressed, he pays not and they beset him ; is that woeful too ? "

18. " Surely, Lord. "

19. "And when beset, he pays not and they bind him; is that woeful too?"

20. " Surely, Lord. "

21. "Thus, monks, poverty, debt, borrowing,

being pressed, beset and bound are all woes for the worldly wanton.

22.“ Woeful in the world is poverty and debt.”

23. Thus the Buddha’s conception of Dukkha is material.

(2)

Impermanence as the Cause of Gloom

1. Another ground for this accusation arises from the doctrine that everything which is compound is impermanent.

2. Nobody questions the truth of the doctrine.

3. Everything is impermanent is admitted by all.

4. The doctrine, if it is true, must be told just as truth must be told however unpleasant it may be.

5. But why draw a pessimistic conclusion?

6. If life is short it is short and one need not be gloomy about it.

7. It is just a matter of interpretation.

8. The Burmese interpretation is very much different.

9. The Burmese celebrate the event of death in a family as though it was an event of joy.

10. On the day of death the householder gives a public feast and the people remove the dead body to the graveyard dancing. Nobody minds the death for it was to come.

11. If impermanence is pessimistic it is only because permanence was assumed to be true although it was a false one.

12. Buddha’s preaching cannot, therefore, be charged as spreading gloom.

(3)

Is Buddhism Pessimistic ?

1. The Buddha’s Dhamma has been accused of creating pessimism.

2. The accusation arises from the first Aryan Truth which says that there is Dukkha (sorrow-misery) in the world.

VI

3. It is rather surprising that a reference to Dukkha should give cause to such an accusation.

4. Karl Marx also said that there is exploitation in the world and the rich are being made richer and the poor are being made poorer.

5. And yet nobody has said that Karl Marx's doctrine is pessimism.

6. Why then should a different attitude be shown to the Buddha's doctrine?

7. It may be because the Buddha is reported to have said in his first sermon, Birth is sorrowful, old age is sorrowful, death is sorrowful, that a deeper pessimistic colouring has been given to his Dhamma.

8. But those who know rhetoric know that this is an artifice of exaggeration and that it is practised by skilled literary hands to produce effect.

9. That birth is sorrowful is an exaggeration by the Buddha can be proved by reference to a sermon of his in which he has preached that birth as a human being is a very precious thing.

10. Again, if the Buddha had merely referred to Dukkha such an accusation could be sustainable.

11. But the Buddha's second Aryan Truth emphasizes that this Dukkha must be removed. In order to emphasize the duty of removal of Dukkha he spoke of the existence of Dukkha.

12. To the removal of Dukkha the Buddha attached great importance. It is because he found that Kapila merely stated that there was Dukkha and said nothing more about it that he felt dissatisfied and left the Ashram of Muni Alara Kalam.

13. How can this Dhamma be called pessimistic?

14. Surely a teacher who is anxious to remove Dukkha cannot be charged with pessimism.

§ 5. *Critics of the Theory of Soul and Rebirth*

1. The Blessed Lord preached that there was no Soul. The Blessed Lord also affirmed that there was rebirth.